The integration of social values in physical education and sport to develop teenage students’ character: a systematic review

La integración de los valores sociales en la educación física y el deporte para la formación del carácter de los alumnos adolescentes: una revisión sistemática

*Suyato, *Hendra Setyawan, **Sri Endang Edi Sukarti, ***Abdul Aziz Purnomo Shidiq, ****Arief Darmawan, *****Gusliana HB, ******Zulbahri, *******Özgür Eken, ********Ratko Pavlovic, *********Francesca Latino, **********Francesco Tafuri  
*Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta (Indonesia), **Universitas Sebelas Maret (Indonesia), ***Universitas Negeri Malang (Indonesia), ****Universitas Riau (Indonesia), *****Universitas Negeri Padang (Indonesia), *******Inonu University (Turkey), *******University of East Sarajevo (Bosnia and Herzegovina), **********Pegaso University (Italy), **********Nicolò Cusano University (Italy)

Abstract. The objective of this study is to examine how social values can be included in Physical Education (PE) and Sports to shape teenage students’ character. The study was conducted by systematically reviewing existing literature on this topic. The data was collected using the Scite software, specifically focusing on the reputable journals indexed in the Scopus and DOAJ databases. The search was limited to articles published between 2019 and 2024. The specified keywords were “Integration AND Social Values AND Physical Education AND Sports”. In addition, the PRISMA technique was used as the main reference. According to the result, a total of 122 articles were discovered from these two databases. The study’s findings highlighted the significance of incorporating social values into PE in order to develop teenage students’ character. It found the arena of physical exercise as the potential place to enhance student concentration, motivation, mental health, and academic accomplishment. Thus, revisiting the curriculum to align with students’ interests and skills, enhance teachers' competency, upgrade facilities, and implement a forward-thinking and consistent sports strategy is crucial. PE and sports enable pupils to internalize social ideals, including respect, equality, cooperation, discipline, and responsibility. Family participation might additionally enhance and promote the assimilation of favourable values. This research also found that Teaching Personal and Social Responsibility (TPSR) and Active Values program are essential for integrating the values of responsibility and independence.

Keywords: Integration, Social Values, Physical Education, Adolescent Students

Resumen. El objetivo de este estudio es examinar cómo pueden incluirse los valores sociales en la educación física (EF) y el deporte para formar el carácter de los alumnos adolescentes. Para ello, se realizará una revisión sistemática de la bibliografía existente. Los datos se recogieron utilizando el programa informático Scite, centrándose específicamente en las revistas indexadas incluidas en las bases de datos Scopus y DOAJ. La búsqueda se limitó a artículos publicados entre 2019 y 2024. La revista se eligió en función de los criterios de inclusión de estar incluida en las revistas SCOPUS y DOAJ reconocidas internacionalmente. La palabra clave especificada es “Integration AND Social Values AND Physical Education AND Sports”. Según el resultado de la búsqueda, se descubrió un total de 122 artículos de diversas fuentes. Este estudio se adhirió a la técnica PRISMA para la operacionalización estándar. Las conclusiones del estudio destacan la importancia de incorporar valores sociales en la educación física para moldear el carácter de los alumnos adolescentes. El ámbito del ejercicio físico tiene el potencial de mejorar la concentración, la motivación, la salud mental y el rendimiento académico de los estudiantes. Es crucial renovar el plan de estudios para adaptarlo a los intereses y habilidades de los alumnos, mejorar la competencia de los profesores, modernizar las instalaciones y aplicar una estrategia deportiva coherente y con visión de futuro. La educación física permite a los alumnos interiorizar ideales sociales como el respeto, la igualdad, la cooperación, la disciplina y la responsabilidad. Además, la participación de las familias puede potenciar y reforzar la asimilación de principios favorables. Implantar un programa de Enseñanza de la Responsabilidad Personal y Social (TPSR) y de Valores Activos es esencial para integrar la actividad física con la enseñanza de la responsabilidad y la independencia.

Palabras Clave: Integración, Valores Sociales, Educación Física, Alumnos Adolescentes

Zulbahri Zulbahri  
zulbahri@fik.unp.ac.id

Introduction

Essentially, school is not only a place for transferring knowledge but also attitudes, skills, and values. In particular, emphasis is now placed on social values and characters. These values are usually integrated into the subject-matter courses encompassing social and natural sciences. One of the perfect examples is Pancasila Education and Citizenship (PPKN), a pioneer in supporting the integration of social values and character development for Indonesian citizens. This subject is included in the school curriculum together with other disciplines.

The integration of social attitudes and character does not only rely on theoretical instructions in the classroom, which may become burdensome for students, but also emphasizes practical applications and recreational activities. One suitable lesson that might enhance this integrated program is Physical Education (PE). This subject allows kids to understand the significance of social values and character development. While classroom instruction creates the academic foundation, practical and recreational techniques, such as PE, are necessary to foster the holistic development of students’ social values and character through scheduled physical activities (Kamaruddin et al., 2023). Moreover, PE not only involves physical performance, but also teaches students important social values, such as mutual respect, cooperation, ethical behavior, morality, and other social attitudes. These objectives align with the goals of the PPKN.
subjects, which are integrated into real-life situations in the Physical Education classroom.

Incorporating social values into physical education and sports is essential for shaping the character of teenage students. Studies have demonstrated that engaging in physical education can cultivate significant character virtues, such as athleticism, drive, accountability, self-control, adherence, behavioral regulation, and student engagement (Saputra et al., 2022). However, sometimes PE serves a multifaceted purpose beyond just physical development. It significantly contributes to the entire development of students, fostering social and emotional growth. Earlier studies noted that physical education significantly impacts character development, encompassing not only physical abilities but also values and positive attitudes, such as diligence, self-control, cooperation, and bravery (Kamaruddin et al., 2023; Kroufek & Nepraš, 2023). It is unsurprising that various educational ideas and approaches encourage the incorporation of social values into physical education. For instance, the application of small-sided games has demonstrated a positive impact on students' inherent drive and interpersonal conduct (Lugaya et al., 2019). After that, cooperative learning models, such as the Students Teams Achievement Divisions, are suggested because they can enhance learning outcomes and foster a helpful learning atmosphere (Widyaningsih, 2023). The Self-Determination Theory (SDT) is a prominent theoretical framework that aids in comprehending students' motivation in a physical education setting, emphasizing the significance of establishing an atmosphere that fosters intrinsic motivation (Lugaya et al., 2019).

Incorporating character values into formal education needs the involvement of teachers, parents, and the entire school community (Nurhidai et al., 2020). Particularly, teachers have a crucial role in imparting values to students at school. Multiple techniques can be employed to successfully communicate these values, as underscored by Khurrohman (2021). They are responsible for not only teaching physical skills but also imparting values, such as discipline, collaboration, and sportsmanship, to children at school. This dual function is essential for promoting character education that aligns with national, cultural, and ethical norms (Nurjanah, 2023). In addition, the recent Covid-19 pandemic required a substantial adjustment in the mode of educational delivery. An investigation has been conducted to assess the efficacy of online physics education during the pandemic time. The study confirmed the challenges and possibilities of including character development activities in virtual settings (Nugroho, 2022). Notwithstanding these obstacles, the dedication to character education remains unwavering, showcasing the tenacity and adaptability of the teachers.

Although many scholars advocate the role of PE in embedding characters and values, some others argue that cultivating social values will only be beneficial if it is taught as a separate subject, such as Citizenship Education. Undoubtedly, some teachers are unwilling to undertake additional responsibilities associated with fostering such societal norms. One commonly cited reason is the perceived lack of importance of certain disciplines, such as physical education, in cultivating social ideals among students. Hence, additional research should be conducted to persuade the in-charge parties who have not endorsed the endeavors of social values by incorporating the values into other domains, such as physical education.

Indeed, research on physical education has touched on many areas. For example, some popular studies investigated the achievement of physical education learning outcomes (Martono et al., 2024; Septiantoko et al., 2024). Other studies examined specific areas of PE or sports, such as health and fitness sports (Widiyanto et al., 2024a; Widiyanto et al., 2024b), law and sports education (HB et al., 2024), sports communication (Charlina et al., 2024), active lifestyle with exercise (Tafuri et al., 2024), therapeutic sports (Zanada et al., 2024), movement skills (Anam et al., 2024; Pranoto et al., 2024), and sports training and performance (Bahtra et al., 2024; Kurniawan et al., 2024). Meanwhile, other studies were related to the curriculum and management of physical education learning (Mardiyah et al., 2024; Yani et al., 2024) and the management of sports education and achievement (Hansyah et al., 2024; Komari et al., 2024; Mulyanti et al., 2024; Setyawan et al., 2023a; Setyawan et al., 2023b; Setyawan et al., 2024a; Setyawan et al., 2024b; Setyawan et al., 2024c; Destriani et al., 2024).

Despite the myriad research, there is a lack of scholarly research on incorporating social values in physical education and sports to cultivate teenage students’ character. The dearth of studies on this topic can impede understanding how to effectively enhance students' social values and character as exemplary citizens across a range of courses with significant promise in achieving this objective. Hence, it is imperative to research this issue by thoroughly reviewing existing literature studies.

**Materials & Methods**

This study provided comprehensive insights into incorporating social values in physical education (PE) and sports to shape teenage students’ character. This insight was achieved by conducting a thorough literature review. The study employed the systematic literature review method to identify, evaluate, and interpret all research findings. It used the "Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses" (PRISMA) guidelines as the main reference (Tricco et al., 2018). These guidelines aim to create a transparent, comprehensive, and precise report, aiding evidence-based decision-making (Page et al., 2021). This systematic literature review compiled all existing scientific evidence based on the specified inclusion and exclusion criteria (Martin-Moya & González-Fernández, 2022). One example of the inclusion criteria was that the articles were published in a globally recognized journal indexed by Scopus and DOAJ. The complete inclusion and exclusion requirements are outlined in Table 1 below:
Table 1. Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Inclusion</th>
<th>Exclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time/Period</td>
<td>Journals published in 2019-2024</td>
<td>Journal published before 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indexed</td>
<td>Globally recognized journals indexed by Scopus and DOAJ</td>
<td>Journal indexed by other than Scopus and DOAJ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
<td>Open access</td>
<td>Closed access or subscription</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>English-language journals</td>
<td>Non-English-language journals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Text</td>
<td>Articles matching scope/theme</td>
<td>Articles not matching Scope/topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document/Article Type</td>
<td>Original research article</td>
<td>Review, conference proceeding, book, book chapter, book series, editorial, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic of Discussion</td>
<td>- The content of the article is relevant to the theme of integration of social values in physical education (PE) and sports</td>
<td>- The content of the article is not relevant to the theme of integration of social values in physical education (PE) and sports</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

On the other hand, the exclusion criteria for this study are limited to international journals that were not indexed in Scopus and DOAJ. Using the Scite software, the study searched for the journals using the following keywords: "Integration AND Social Values AND Physical Education AND Sports". The search retrieved 122 articles from several sources. After undertaking several screening processes, eight articles that aligned with the theme and fulfilled the inclusion criteria, or at least some of them, were selected to enhance the discussion's focus. The detailed procedures are illustrated in Figure 1 below:

Results

This section presents key findings regarding the incorporation of social values in Physical Education (PE). These findings are summarized in Table 2.

Table 2. Literature Review Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Results/Kesimpulan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Mocanu &amp; Iordan, 2021)</td>
<td>The study ascertains the student’s perception of the Faculty of Physical Education and Sports regarding their utilisation of leisure time and discerns any disparities in viewpoints based on body mass index BMI (Body Mass Index).</td>
<td>The study determined that students who were overweight exhibited a decreased propensity to participate in active recreational activities. Hence, it is imperative to mitigate the issues arising from this way of living. The study also suggests that the findings should be limited to similar contexts but cannot be extrapolated to the other university community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Tudor &amp; Pidaru, 2021)</td>
<td>The objective of the study is to establish performance benchmarks that are tailored to the requirements of high school students in physical education and sports. In addition, it emphasised the significance of curriculum revisions to synchronise with the students’ interests and capabilities.</td>
<td>The study concludes that curriculum reform is crucial in the current Romanian education system. It emphasises the need to establish and implement performance standards at all levels of education in order to ensure consistent evaluation and enable national comparison of student outcomes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Chan &amp; Fei, 2022)</td>
<td>The objective of the research was to identify issues and promotional tactics in the instruction of taekwondo at the collegiate level.</td>
<td>The study concluded that colleges should promote taekwondo instruction, enhance teacher training and quality, and upgrade facilities. By implementing these strategies, Taekwondo instruction can enhance student engagement and involvement while promoting physical and mental growth.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Rockliffe et al., 2023)</td>
<td>The research aimed to provide an assessment framework encompassing the structures and elements that impact physical education, physical activity, and sports in educational institutions.</td>
<td>The study’s conclusion suggests that the data can be used as a foundation for creating a national programme assessment index. It can be used to guide policies and actions at both the local and national levels. It is advisable to replicate this strategy in other nations in order to acquire comparable information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Behlul et al., 2023)</td>
<td>They conducted an analysis of the perspectives held by many stakeholders. The research focused on the training policy for physical education and sports teachers in the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus (T.R.N.C). They proposed remedies for the education system in the area.</td>
<td>The study’s findings indicate that sports strategy in the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus (T.R.N.C.) is merely a rhetorical exercise without practical implementation. Two possible reasons might be due to political influence and the absence of systematic support. Consequently, the progress of sports is constrained, and the engagement of young individuals in sports is less impactful. The study anticipated the government’s forthcoming enactment of a sports policy that is both sustainable and consistent.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Lesco &amp; Goncearuc, 2019)</td>
<td>This study attempted to establish the fundamental principles of instructing parents on behavioural techniques in physical education for pupils of the corresponding age group. It also assessed the parents’ ability to instill sporting ideals as virtues.</td>
<td>The study's findings indicated that parental involvement in physical education over a one-year course enhances communication style and family relationships, facilitates the adoption of appropriate and effective family education strategies,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1. PRISMA flowchart of the article selection process
and examined their behaviour in fostering these values in their children. and exerts a substantial impact on the attitudes and behaviour of all family members.

The purpose of this research was to discover the fundamental values that are cultivated in physical education in schools. It developed, implemented, and assessed instructional activities incorporating these core values for Physical Science students.

The study's findings determined that future professionals should enhance respect, equality, and kindness. Meanwhile, the significance of humility, collaboration, and empathy is emphasised by gender inequalities. Based on the findings, engaging in activities that promote teamwork and creativity is more beneficial. Nevertheless, practicing ideals such as equality and perseverance might be more challenging.

The research sought to elucidate the fundamental cognitive processes and procedural framework of the educational programme "ACTIVE VALUES," which is specifically devised to mitigate sedentary lifestyles and foster value-based education inside schools.

The study determined that the "Active Values" programme successfully integrates Active Rest with the Teaching Personal and Social Responsibility (TPSR) paradigm. The program increases students' physical activity levels and cultivates values related to responsibility and independence. In addition, the programme enhances student leadership, academic performance, and psychosocial well-being while also tackling issues of immobility and disruptive behaviour in classrooms.

Discussion

This section elaborates on key findings proposed by researchers in this systematic review. First, scholars have reported that student participation in physical activities, such as sports and physical fitness routines, can enhance student engagement and academic performance. For example, they significantly enhance student attentiveness, motivation, and mental well-being, facilitating active classroom involvement (Goswami et al., 2022). Consistent engagement in physical activity will also directly influence students' academic achievement. Research by Mocanu and Jordan (2021) discovered a correlation between students who are overweight and their lower levels of participation in physical activity. The results indicate the need for implementing a program that can effectively inspire and engage all students, including those who may have lower levels of motivation to actively participate. As mentioned earlier, engaging in regular physical activity not only improves physical well-being but also enhances character development by fostering greater social engagement and self-discipline.

The second finding in this research is the article that investigated the curriculum reform in PE. The primary objective of a curriculum reform that prioritizes students' interests and talents is to enhance engagement and improve learning results. By offering students the opportunity to select subjects aligned with their interests and assisting in cultivating particular skills, they can enhance their learning experience and increase their motivation. Tudor and Pislaru (2021) noted the significance of modifying the physical education curriculum to align with the student’s preferences and capabilities. By implementing unambiguous and uniform criteria for assessing performance, nationwide evaluations may be conducted to guarantee that all children derive maximum advantages from physical education. In short, creating meaningful and relevant learning experiences for students is crucial. Research by Hadiputra et al. (2019) showed that teachers' performance in analyzing physical education evaluation outcomes in schools focuses on complete evaluation aspects, such as attitudes, knowledge, and abilities. This highlights the multidimensional character of student learning evaluation. Another interesting topic to discuss is facilities. Enhancing the caliber of physical education (playing fields and athletic gear) requires the cultivation of instructors' expertise and the provision of suitable infrastructure (Arif et al., 2021). It is vital for efficient instruction and student engagement (Clarita et al., 2021).

To make the subject more inclusive, the subject needs to incorporate adaptive physical education in schools to improve student engagement and socialization, particularly for children with disabilities (Habibie & Trifitrianto, 2020). These combined efforts contribute to creating a comprehensive approach to physical education, fostering character development, and advocating for healthy lifestyles among students. This notion is supported by Chun and Fei (2022). They believed that enhancing the caliber of instruction and resources would guarantee a more efficient inculcation of social values, such as cooperation, discipline, and responsibility.

Assessment system issues are also found in this systematic review. An assessment system at the national level or a framework for evaluating Physical Education is crucial for quantifying physical abilities and cultivating desirable characteristics, such as sportsmanship, collaboration, self-control, and accountability. Various evaluation methods, including self-assessment, peer assessment, instructor observation, activity assignments, portfolios, checklists, essays, and oral discourses, have become prominent in education (Evangelou et al., 2022). Moreover, authentic assessment, grounded in life values, combines the ideals and principles of authoritative assessment with citizenship education, specifically emphasizing student character development (Komalasari & Saripudin, 2020). In this case, creating structured instruments is crucial as they enable teachers to assess and foster positive attitudes among kids through physical activity. By employing a suitable assessment framework, students are anticipated to not only meet heavy physical benchmarks but also internalize crucial ethical and societal principles. The research also recommends that policymakers learn how to incorporate attitude assessments into national evaluations, thereby enhancing the role of physical education in fostering student character development on a broader scale. Research by Rocliffe et al. (2023) mentioned that it is imperative to establish an assessment framework comprising structures and factors.
that impact physical education, physical activity, and sports in schools. This will serve as a foundation for creating a national program evaluation index, which will inform policies and initiatives at both local and national levels.

Effective and well-executed sports policies have the potential to enhance young engagement in sports and facilitate the development of character. An investigation by Behlul et al. (2023) pointed out that the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus (T.R.N.C.) emphasized the significance of implementing a sports policy that is both sustainable and consistent. Integrating societal principles into physical education programs can have a substantial impact on the formation of teenage characters and enhance their involvement in sports (Gatouillat et al., 2019). This is because engaging in athletics is acknowledged as a potent method to cultivate favorable character traits in adolescents (Mwenda et al., 2023). Furthermore, research has demonstrated that engaging in sports activities has a beneficial impact on the development of prosocial behavior in children and adolescents (Li & Wei-de, 2022). Participating in sports throughout adolescence can also have a preventive impact against substance misuse and improve self-discipline and prosocial conduct (Zenic et al., 2020).

Well-defined and coherent sports strategies are crucial for enhancing young engagement in sports and fostering character development. Robust policy support facilitates educational programs to prioritize physical and moral development, resulting in the cultivation of resilient and well-prepared younger generations capable of overcoming future challenges. Integrating social values into sports programs is crucial for positively shaping teenagers' character.

Family participation in physical education is another crucial factor for enhancing family dynamics and shaping the attitudes and behavior of all family members toward physical activity (Kondratska et al., 2021). Family engagement has a beneficial influence on student academic performance, attendance, and motivation (Taseer et al., 2023). Thus, promoting parental involvement in facilitating learning through home-based educational activities and coordinating educational events are crucial to support students’ educational process (Marin, 2019). Engaging in educational activities at home and organizing educational events can improve the educational process (Marin, 2019). In general, when families participate in physical education, it not only helps the students individually but also enhances the overall well-being and unity of the family. Research indicates that parental participation in physical education can strengthen familial bonds and substantially impact the attitudes and behaviors of all family members (Lesco & Goncœuruc, 2019). This underscores the crucial role of the family in promoting the incorporation of social values into physical education.

In physical education, Ramirez et al. (2021) highlighted the significance of core principles, such as respect, equality, and decency, in influencing the educational environment. Kamaruddin et al. (2023) explored the significance of teachers in imparting fundamental principles in physical education to students by validating several methods through which these principles can be effectively conveyed. In addition, Purwadi (2022) highlighted the importance of physical education in enhancing the character development of children aged 6-8 through hands-on activities and practical approaches. This statement emphasizes the multifaceted nature of physical education, which goes beyond mere physical activity. The study confirmed the role of physical education in imparting values and shaping individuals from a young age. Empirical investigations (Bayu et al., 2021) indicated the need for high-quality physical education that integrates digital technologies to improve learning experiences. Physical education encompasses not just physical activity but also cognitive and social dimensions, stressing a comprehensive educational approach that fosters all facets of student growth (Wahyunal & Gazali, 2022).

According to Burhacın et al. (2022), the significant impact of well-structured physical education on fostering an active lifestyle is enhancing physical literacy and cultivating the necessary skills and interests to sustain physical exercise over a student's whole life. Ramirez et al. (2021) emphasized the significance of the core principles of this subject, such as respect, equality, and kindness. Physical education is crucial for improving physical fitness and fostering important values, character development, and overall well-being among children. By incorporating fundamental principles into the physical education curriculum, teachers can greatly influence the development of persons who possess the capacity to confront life's challenges with integrity and resilience.

To comprehend the effects of innovative educational programs on student growth, research has demonstrated that the integration of Active Rest and the Teaching Personal and Social Responsibility (TPSR) model, known as the "Active Values" program, can effectively increase student physical activity levels and promote the development of values such as responsibility and independence (Jiménez-Parría et al., 2022). The curriculum also enhances kids' academic performance and emotional well-being. When the TPSR model is implemented thoroughly, it can provide favorable outcomes on psychological factors that extend beyond physical education (Mu’arifin et al., 2022). The comprehension and implementation of the TPSR model by educators significantly influence the development of responsible behavior in students (Manzano-Sánchez et al., 2021); (Man et al., 2020). Finally, incorporating the TPSR model into physical education programs like "Active Values" can greatly enhance kids' physical activity levels, academic achievements, and psychological well-being. This method is successful in fostering the ideals of accountability and self-reliance while also playing a role in the comprehensive development of the character of adolescent students.
Conclusion

The study's objective is to examine the incorporation of social values into physical education (PE) and sports as a means of shaping teenage students' character. Using a systematic literature review methodology, the study concludes that incorporating social values into physical education is crucial. Physical exercise offers opportunities to enhance student concentration, motivation, mental health, and academic accomplishment. Thus, it is crucial to revisit the curriculum to align with students' interests and skills, enhance teachers' competency, upgrade facilities, and implement a forward-thinking and consistent sports strategy. Moreover, physical education enables students to internalize social ideals, including respect, equality, cooperation, discipline, and responsibility. Family participation might additionally enhance and bolster the assimilation of favorable principles. To enhance students' academic performance and psychosocial components, it is imperative to introduce a Teaching Personal and Social Responsibility (TPSR) and Active Values program. This program integrates physical activity with the teaching of responsibility and independence. Integrating social values into physical education contributes to the comprehensive development of teenage pupils' character, preparing them to become well-rounded individuals.

Conflicts of interest

The author declares no conflict of interest.

References


Marin, D.-C. (2019). The Effects of a High Family Involvement in Pupil’s Education. https://doi.org/10.15405/cpchs.2019.08.03.105


Trico, A. C., Lillie, E., Zarin, W., O’Brien, K. K., Colquhoun, H., Levac, D., Moher, D., Peters, M. D.


